

Arya Marganda Simanjuntak,* Indra Yovi,** Patricia Dean Ully Marbun,* Adinda Elisabet*

*Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia. **Department of Pulmonology and Respiratory Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Abstract

ព្រៀ

Introduction: Globally, cases of pulmonary tuberculosis (PTB) are rising by 4%, while new cases have declined in many nations, most notably by 14% in Indonesia. During the COVID-19 pandemic, the number of undiagnosed and untreated PTB patients could rise and infect more people. In particular, CD8+ lymphocytes were decreased in COVID-19. Perhaps this is the cause of the rise in cases, but there is no data to show it. Aim: Determine current data about the PTB with COVID-19 coinfection and possible reactivation of PTB after COVID-19 infection in LTB patient.

Methods: This systematic review is based on PRISMA statements using Pubmed, EBSCOHost, Science Direct and Cochrane from December 2019 to July 2022. Inclusion and exclusion criteria were set to select studies that included. We analyze risk of bias of all included studies with JBI critical appraisal tools.

Results: This study had 107,425 patients in total from 20 studies. All studies were deemed to have low overall author bias risks. A critical component of PTB defense is CD8+. By reducing lymphocytes, COVID-19 can encourage the growth of PTB, which might therefore result in coinfection or the reactivation of existing PTB.

Conclusion: COVID-19 possibly increase case of PTB in form of co-infection or reactivation of PTB in LTB patients. This needs special attention for patients that have infected by COVID-19 to followed up for risk developing PTB.

Keywords: Coinfection, COVID-19, Reactivation, Tuberculosis

Korespondensi: Arya Marganda Simanjuntak E-mail: arya.marganda@gmail.com



Introduction

Pulmonary Tuberculosis (PTB) cases in Indonesia are increasing by 18% from 819.000 to 969.000.^{1,2} There has been a new notification drop from Indonesia by 14% in TB Global Report 2021.¹ This shows the possibility patients were undiagnosed and untreated but the case of PTB in Indonesia are still huge. Worst case scenario that could be happen shown in TB Global report in 2022 by increased cases of PTB. This is because of the "time lag" that undiagnosed and untreated patients could infect others.² There is the impact of the pandemic COVID-19 that caused this time lag such as (1) patients that afraid to check their symptoms to healthcare facilities, (2) community mobility regulations from the government during the pandemic COVID-19 by level (I - IV), and (3) unequal accessibility to online health services. During pandemic COVID-19, we learn that COVID-19 infection regarding of severity could have impact to immune system. COVID-19 could decrease of lymphocyte such as memory T cells and cytotoxic CD8+ cells.³ In the other hand, immune system are important especially in latent tuberculosis (LTB) patients so the Mycobacterium tuberculosis (M.tb) would not develop in to active state. It estimates that 25% earth population already infected with M.tb but only 5% in active condition and 95% in latent phase.⁴ Reactivation of latent tuberculosis could be happen in the patient in immunocompromised condition. We hypothesized there are reactivation of latent tuberculosis after COVID-19 infection but because lack of awareness it's underreported. Therefore, we conduct this systematic review to determine current data about the PTB with COVID-19 coinfection and possible reactivation of PTB after COVID-19 infection in LTB patient.

Method

Literature Search Strategy

This systematic review is based on the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement. Literature searches were performed on the PubMed, Cochrane, Science Direct and EBSCOhost databases. To find related literature, we used the following keywords: "Latent Tuberculosis" OR "Latent Tuberculosis Infection" AND "COVID-19" OR "SARS-CoV-2" OR "2019-nCoV" AND "Tuberculosis". The literature to be reviewed is a study published between December 2019 and July 2022. Further details on the search strategy can be seen in Figure 1. Literature in the form of observational studies (cross-sectional and cohort), case reports, case series, systematic reviews and meta-analysis, (4) Study using English. Several exclusion criteria have been set as follows: (1) Patients diagnosed with TB during a pandemic without a history of COVID-19 infection before/ during/after TB diagnosis, (2) Diagnosis of TB without using radiological or microbiological evidence, (3) Patients with suspected COVID-19 19 with a history of TB.

Data Extraction and Study Quality Assessment

From all the literature that met the inclusion criteria set, we extracted the relevant data. The extracted data included author, year of publication, study design, sample size, and study results (Table 1). We critical appraise all included studies to determine risk of bias with Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) critical appraisal tools. All authors analyze and discuss to score all risk of bias. Any mismatch/disagreement were solved in discussion with all authors.



Figure 1. Literature Search Strategy According to PRISMA Flowchart.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Result

The inclusion criteria were set as follows: (1) The study took place from December 2019 – June 2022, (2) Open Access, (3) All authors analyze risk of bias to all included studies using JBI critical appraisal tools (Figure 2). All studies considered low



Figure 2. JBI Risk of Bias Score of All Included Studies

risk of bias from all authors.

In total, 20 studies included with 107,425 total patients (Table 1). Several stud-

ies reported case of coinfection of PTB with COVID-19 and several report PTB after COVID-19 suspected from LTB patients.

Author, year of	Study Design	Study Location	Study title	n	Study Results
Sarinoglu; 2020 ¹¹	Cross- sectional	Turkey	Tuberculosis and COVID-19: An overlapping situation during the pandemic	30	Two patients had both COVID-19 and TB diagnoses. One patient had a COVID-19 diagnosis first, followed by a TB diagnosis, whereas another received a COVID-19 diagnosis first.
Liu,2020 ¹²	Case Report	China	Severe COVID-19 cases with a history of active or latent tuberculosis	3	One patient had concurrent MDR-TB and COVID-19 infections, and there were two patients with positive IGRA results followed by COVID-19 infections. As TB coinfec- tion can result in immunosuppression in the first place, it is not advised to administer corticosteroids to COVID-19 patients who also have TB.
Faqihi, 2020 ¹³	Case Report	Saudi Arabia	COVID-19 in a patient with active tuberculosis: A rare case-report	1	A 60-year-old man comes in with a chest ache, myalgia, a persistent productive cough, and other symptoms. The patient underwent RT-PCR testing, and COVID-19 was detected. The patient has a history of tuberculosis and has had treatment outside of Saudi Arabia
Madan; 2021 ¹⁴	Cross- Sectional	India	Impact of Latent Tuberculosis on Severity and Out- comes in Admitted COVID-19 Patients	60	There are 15 people with latent TB who have COVID-19 infection. Patients with latent TB showed higher levels of lympho- cytes and monocytes than other patients but less radiological damage (p 0.05).
Rajaman- ickam; 2021 ¹⁵	Cross- Sectional	India	Latent tuberculo- sis co-infection is associated with heightened levels of humoral, cytokine and acute phase re- sponses in seropos- itive SARS-CoV-2 infection	133	72 LTBI – and 61 LTBI+. Comparatively to LTBI persons, LTBI+ people who were seropositive for SARS-CoV_2 infection had higher levels of humoral, cytokine, and acute-phase responses. Hence, in those who are seropositive for SARS-CoV-2 infection, LTBI is linked to regulation of cytokine and antibody responses as well as systematic inflammation.
Rajaman- ickam; 2021 ¹⁶	Cross- Sectional	India	Effect of SARS- CoV-2 seroposi- tivity on antigen – specific cytokine and chemokine responses in latent tuberculosis	118	There were 24 LTBI patients without COVID and 35 LTBI patients who tested positive for COVID-19. 39 COVID patients without LTBI, and 20 COVID patients without LTBI and COVID-19. Compared to healthy controls, LTBI patients were not less able to increase chemokine and cyto- kine responses. LTBI patients' cytokine and chemokine responses were unaffected by SARS-CoV-2 infection.

Table 1. Data Extraction Table

Author, year of study	Study Design	Study Location	Study title	n	Study Results
Bostangadiri, 2021 ¹⁷	Systematic Review	Italy	Mycobacterium tuber- culosis and SARS- CoV-2 Coinfections: A Review	106.033	891 of them had both TB and COVID-19 infections. According to some accounts, COVID-19 may cause latent TB to active or aggra- vate respiratory symptoms. Inde- pendent of any other underlying disease or patient state, it appears that both active TB and TB that has already been treated are risk factors for COVID-19 in terms of severity and fatality
Palacios, 2021 ¹⁸	Cohort	Spanish	Clinical and epide- miological correlates of low IFN-gamma responses in mitogen tube of QuantiFERON assay in tuberculosis infection screening during the COVID-19 pandemic: A popula- tion-based marker of COVID-19 mortality?	90	90 LTBI patients, 33 COVID nega- tives, and 57 COVID-19 positives. IGN-g levels dropped as a result of a drop in CD8+ concentrations. Uncover the possibilities of TB reactivation.
Subhro,2021 ¹⁹	Case Report	India	COVID-19 and Pulmonary Tubercu- losis – A diagnostic dilemma	3	3 patients diagnosed with COVID-19 with TB co-infection
Aznar,2021 ²⁰	Cohort	Spanish	Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on tuberculosis man- agement in spain	169	Extra pulmonary TB is the most common kind of TB found in COVID-19 patients (75/169). IR 10.25 per 100.000 people in 2019 and IR 9.31 per 100.000 people for cases of co-TB-COVID-19 infec- tion.
Jacob,2021 ²¹	Case Report	India	Coinfection of SARS- COV-2 and MTB: How not to miss the wood for the trees	1	Immunosuppressive treatment is being given to a 20-year-old lady with multiple sclerosis. COVID-19 has been identified in the patient by PCR. X-rays revealed lung opaci- ty, but the patient had a history of weight loss. Further tests revealed that the patient had TB. Infected people with TB may also have COVID-19 infection.
Khayat,2021 ²²	Case Report	Saudi Arabia	COVID-19 promoting the development of active tuberculosis in a patient with latent tuberculosis infection: A case report	1	A PCR-confirmed COVID-19 diagnosis in a 40-year-old female. She displayed consolidation in the right superior lung lobe 7 weeks later, at which point microbiologi- cal TB was identified. The patient interacted with a girl who had used anti tuberculosis drug in the two years prior.
Afum,2021 ²³	Cross- Sectional	Ghana	Diagnosis of tu- berculosis among COVID-19 suspected cases in Ghana	774	there are 6 (0.8%) co-infected TB and COVID-19 patients in Ghana

Table 1. Data Extraction Table

Author, year of study	Study Design	Study Location	Study title	n	Study Results
Nyanti, 2022 ²⁴	Case- Report	Malaysia	Pulmonary tu- berculosis and COVID-19 coin- fection: Hickam's Dictum revisited	3	Patient 1 had endobronchial tuberculosis that tested positive on smears; she was un- intentionally detected as a result of abnor- malities to her CT-Scan and finally achieved a full recovery. Patient 2 is a COVID-19 patient who passed away but was later identified as having tuberculosis as a result of a positive sputum culture. Patient 3 had empirical TB treatment because they had radiographic sign signs of tuberculosis.
Noori,2022 ²⁵	Case- Report	United States of America	Reactivation of Tuberculosis in the Setting of COVID-19 Infec- tion	1	One month prior, a 76-year-old man had a minor COVID-19 infection. In the left apical of the chest radiograph, there are two opaque, reticulonodular patches. Patients used PCR to confirm TB. Since the patients are from TB endemic areas, they can have TB reactivation. When a patient has a prior history of COVID-19, TB infection should be suspected
Elziny, 2022 ²⁶	Case- Report	Qatar	Case Report: development of miliary pulmonary tuberculosis in a pa- tient with peritoneal tuberculosis	1	A 29-year-old guy was identified as having miliary pulmonary TB after recovering from COVID-19 for two weeks. It's possible that COVID-19 infection speeds up the develop- ment of TB infection.
Friedman, 2022 ²⁷	Case- Report	United States of America	Reactivation of latent tuberculosis in a COVID-19 patient on cortico- steroid treatment	1	A70-year-old female with a COVID-19 diagnosis who has never been exposed to the disease or had TB before. Patients with con- firmed reactivation of TB were cared for six days. The patient's orign as a TB endemic location are known.
Leonso, 2022 ²⁸	Case- Report	United States of America	A Rare Case of Latent Tubercu- losis Reactivation Secondary to a COVID-19 infec- tion	1	Tb reactivation from latent TB was dis- covered in a 74-year-old Filipino woman 3 months after she had recovered from COVID-19. The therapy can aid in the trans- formation of latent TB into active TB when it is known that the patient is taking high dosages of steroids.
Lovino, 2022 ²⁹	Case- Report	Italy	Latent tuberculosis reactivation in the setting of SARS- Cov-2 infection: The analysis of the radiological features that help the diagnosis.	1	A 45-year-old guy arrives with fever and dyspnea. COVID-19 beta version is pres- ent. 15 days of COVID-19 therapy and twice-negative swabs. Hemoptysis, myal- gia, and a productive cough followed three months later. Both the patient's culture and smear results were favorable. Both no prior to TB history and no interaction with TB patients
Landivar, 2022 ³⁰	Case- Report	Spanish	Tuberculosis Reac- tivation After Se- vere SARS-CoV-2 Pneumonia	1	A serious COVID-19 diagnosis in a 69-year- old lady necessitated artificial ventilation. After receiving critical care for 22 days, the patient was discharged. Before being identi- fied with COVID-19, the patient's latent TB infection was known to exist. A biopsy of the nodule found by the CT-Scan 3 months after COVID-19 revealed active TB.

Table 1. Data Extraction Table

Discussion

Potential Mechanism Relation of COVID-19 and PTB

Immune response in patients with COVID-19 can go through various pathways to the occurrence of reduced lymphocyte.³ This condition occurs due to reduce of memory T cells and cytotoxic CD8+ cells. Flow cytometric analysis in COVID-19 patients showed a reduced number of helper T Cells in peripheral blood and reduced number of cytotoxic CD8+ T cells in severe cases.^{3,5} Reduced lymphocyte could result in cell apoptosis in the lung, thereby causing susceptibility to other pathogenic infections. This happens because the cells are increasingly damaged due to apoptosis, facilitating the development of pathogens in these tissues. Other mechanism as spinal cord suppression during cytokine storms and pulmonary sequestration during COVID-19 pneumonia also possible caus-ing reduced lymphocyte.³ Study from China also showed significantly decreased number of CD8+ cells in COVID-19.6 Several studies showed T Cells, especially CD8+ plays important role in the protection against PTB.⁸⁻¹⁰ Decreased of immune response due to reduced T-Cell could increase risk of getting active TB. This could relate of COVID-19 patients may be at increased risk of PTB even if their COVID-19 symptoms are cured.⁷

By those mechanism, it's possible that patient infected by COVID-19 and decrease of the lymphocyte support the development of PTB in the form of co-infection or reactivation. COVID-19 treatment especially using steroid possibly promote immunosuppressive condition that support development of PTB. Special attention is necessary to early detection PTB before it develop into complicated that would be worst prognostic to the patient.

Current Knowledge between COVID-19 and PTB

An infection with COVID-19 can raise the likelihood of having active PTB by seven times, according to a nationwide population-based cohort study from Thailand.⁷ This may explain why the prevalence of TB increased by 4% globally, from 10.1 million to 10.6 million, however the authors could only locate one study that indicated a link between PTB and COVID-19. To determine the risk of COVID-19 to PTB, especially in countries with a high TB burden, more research is required.

Tight community mobilization regulations, including mask regulation, may have decreased PTB transmission. These regulations could prevent droplet transfer, but the evidence indicating an increase in PTB raises a serious concern about how this could have happened. This may occur if there were restrictions on working from home, and internal transmission cannot be avoided. Particularly for undiagnosed and untreated patients living with other family members, in-house transmission may occur. This may lead to an increased in PTB cases in a family clusters, which may be the cause of an increase in PTB cases during and maybe after the COVID-19 pandemic.

Conclusion

COVID-19 infection possibly increased case of PTB in form of co-infection or reactivation of PTB in LTB Patients. This needs special attention for patients that have infected COVID-19 to followed up for risk developing PTB.

References

- 1. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2021. World Health ORganization; 2021.
- 2. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2022. Geneva: 2022.
- Azkur AK, Akdis M, Azkur D, Sokolowska M, van de Veen W, Brüggen MC, et al. Immune response to SARS-CoV-2 and mechanisms of immunopathological changes in COVID-19. Allergy. 2020 Jul;75(7):1564-81.
- 4. Burhan E, Isbaniah F, Aditama TY. Tuberkulosis dan COVID-19. Fakultas Kedokteran Universitas Indonesia; 2021.
- 5. Chuan Qin, Zhou L, Hu Z, Zhang S. Dysregulation of immune response in patients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China Chuan. J Chem Inf Model 2020;53(9):1689–99.
- Jiang Y, Wei X, Guan J, Qin S, Wang Z, Lu H, et al. COVID-19 pneumonia: CD8+ T and NK cells are decreased in number but compensatory increased in cytotoxic potential. Clin Immunol [Internet] 2020;218:108516. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. clim.2020.108516
- Kumwichar P, Chongsuvivatwong V. COVID-19 pneumonia and the subsequent risk of getting active pulmonary tuberculosis: a population-based dynamic cohort study using national insurance claims

databases. eClinicalMedicine [Internet] 2023;56:101825. Available from: https://doi. org/10.1016/j.eclinm.2023.101825

- Loxton AG. Bcells and their regulatory functions during tuberculosis: latency and active disease. Molecular immunology. 2019 Jul 1;111:145-51.
- 9. Lin PL, Rutledge T, Green AM, Bigbee M, Fuhrman C, Klein E, et al. CD4 T cell depletion exacerbates acute Mycobacterium tuberculosis while reactivation of latent infection is dependent on severity of tissue depletion in cynomolgus macaques. AIDS research and human retroviruses. 2012 Dec 1;28(12):1693-702.
- Rao M, Ippolito G, Mfinanga S, Ntoumi F, Yeboah-Manu D, Vilaplana C, et al. Latent TB infection (LTBI)–Mycobacterium tuberculosis pathogenesis and the dynamics of the granuloma battleground. International Journal of Infectious Diseases. 2019 Mar 1;80:S58-61.
- Sarınoğlu RC, Sili U, Eryuksel E, Yildizeli SO, Cimsit C, Yagci AK. Tuberculosis and COVID-19: An overlapping situation during pandemic. The Journal of Infection in Developing Countries. 2020 Jul 31;14(07):721-5.
- Liu C, Yu Y, Fleming J, Wang T, Shen S, Wang Y, et al. Severe COVID-19 cases with a history of active or latent tuberculosis. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2020;24(7):747–9.
- Faqihi F, Alharthy A, Noor AF, Balshi A, Balhamar A, Karakitsos D. COVID-19 in a patient with active tuberculosis: A rare case-report. Respir Med Case Reports [Internet] 2020;31:101146. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rmcr.2020.101146
- 14. Madan M, Baldwa B, Raja A, Tyagi R, Dwivedi T, Anant M. Impact of Latent Tuberculosis on Severity and Outcomes in Admitted COVID-19 Patients. Cureus [Internet] 2021;Available from: https://www.cureus. com/articles/78004-impact-of-latent-tuberculosis-on-severity-and-outcomes-in-admitted-covid-19-patients
- 15. Rajamanickan A, Kumar NP, Padmapriyadarsini C, Nancy A, Selvaraj N, Karunanithi K, et al. Latent tuberculosis co-infection is associated with heightened levels of humoral, cytokine and acute phase responses in seropositive SARS-CoV-2 infection. J Infect [Internet] 2021;83(3):339–46. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2021.07.029
- 16. Rajamanickam A, Pavan Kumar N, Chandrasekaran P, Nancy A, Bhavani PK, Selvaraj N, et al. Effect of SARS-CoV-2 seropositivity on antigen – specific cytokine and chemokine responses in latent tuberculosis. Cytokine

[Internet] 2022;150:155785. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cyto.2021.155785

- Bostanghadiri N, Jazi FM, Razavi S, Fattorini L, Darban-Sarokhalil D. Mycobacterium tuberculosis and SARS-CoV-2 Coinfections: A Review. Front Microbiol 2022;12(February):1–9.
- Palacios-Gutiérrez J-J, Rodríguez-Guardado A, Arias-Guillén M, Alonso-Arias R, Palacios-Penedo S, García-García J-M, et al. Clinical and epidemiological correlates of low IFN-gamma responses in mitogen tube of QuantiFERON assay in tuberculosis infection screening during the COVID-19 pandemic: A population-based marker of COVID-19 mortality? Arch Bronconeumol [Internet] 2022;(xxxx). Available from: https://doi. org/10.1016/j.arbres.2022.01.011
- 19. Biswas SS, Awal SS, Awal SK. COVID-19 and pulmonary tuberculosis – A diagnostic dilemma. Radiol Case Reports [Internet] 2021;16(11):3255–9. Available from: https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.radcr.2021.07.079
- Aznar ML, Espinosa-Pereiro J, Saborit N, Jové N, Sánchez Martinez F, Pérez-Recio S, et al. Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on tuberculosis management in Spain. Int J Infect Dis 2021;108:300–5.
- 21. Jacob J, Venkataram R, Hosmane GB. Coinfection of SARS-CoV-2 and MTB: How not to miss the wood for the trees. BMJ Case Rep 2021;14(7):2020–2.
- 22. Khayat M, Fan H, Vali Y. COVID-19 promoting the development of active tuberculosis in a patient with latent tuberculosis infection: a case report. Respiratory Medicine Case Reports. 2021 Jan 1;32:101344.
- Afum T, Asare P, Asante-Poku A, Darko-Otchere I, Morgan PA, Bedeley E, et al. Diagnosis of tuberculosis among COVID-19 suspected cases in Ghana. PLoS One [Internet] 2021;16(12 December):1–8. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0261849
- Nyanti LE, Wong ZH, Singh BS, Chang AK, Jobli AT, Chua HH. Pulmonary tuberculosis and COVID-19 coinfection: Hickam's Dictum revisited. Respiratory Medicine Case Reports. 2022 Jan 1;37:101653.
- 25. Noori MAM, Younes I, Latif A, Fichadiya H, Elkattawy S, Garg V. Reactivation of Tuberculosis in the Setting of COVID-19 Infection. Cureus [Internet] 2022;Available from: https://www.cureus.com/articles/89288-reactivation-of-tuberculosis-in-the-setting-of-covid-19-infection
- 26. Elziny MM, Ghazy A, Elfert KA, Aboukamar M. Case report: Development of miliary pul-

monary tuberculosis in a patient with peritoneal tuberculosis after COVID-19 upper respiratory tract infection. Am J Trop Med Hyg 2021;104(5):1792–5.

- Friedman A, DeGeorge KC. Reactivation of latent tuberculosis in a COVID-19 patient on corticosteroid treatment. BMJ Case Rep 2022;15(5):2021–3.
- Leonso A-A, Brown K, Prol R, Rawat S, Khunger A, Bromberg R. A Rare Case of Latent Tuberculosis Reactivation Secondary to a COVID-19 Infection. Infect Dis Rep 2022;14(3):446–52.
- 29. Iovino M, Caruso M, Corvino A, Vargas N, Sandomenico F, Cantelli A, et al. Latent tuberculosis reactivation in the setting of SARS-Cov-2 infection: the analysis of the radiologic features that help the diagnosis. Radiology Case Reports. 2022 Apr 1;17(4):1309-12.
- Cardoso-Landivar J, Jiménez-Fuentes MA, De Souza-Galvão ML. Tuberculosis Reactivation After Severe SARS-COV-2 Pneumonia. Archivos de Bronconeumologia. 2022 Nov 1.